SUMMARY COMPARISON
of 6th grade Math texts
approved for 2007 local Texas adoption

	SAXON MATH ***Course 1*** (Harcourt Achieve, 2007)	***MATH*** ***Course 1*** (McDougal, 2007)	***HOLT MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Holt, 2007)	***TEXAS MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Prentice, 2008)	***TEXAS MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Glencoe, 2007)	**Nonconforming*** ***EVERYDAY MATH*** (McGraw, 2004)	***CONNECTED MATH 2*** (Prentice, 2008)
How much do these texts stress …							
reinventing algorithms more efficiently memorized?	Teaches standard algorithms; develops concepts incrementally	Teaches standard algorithms	Teaches standard algorithms	Teaches standard algorithms	Usually teaches standard algorithms	Students often learn non-standard algorithms or invent their own algorithms.	Protracted student efforts to invent own algorithms preempt class time, multiply redundancies.
calculator dependence over mental training?	Calculator use suggested for 34 problems, not expected elsewhere	Calculator use stipulated for 157 problems, not expected elsewhere	Calculator use stipulated for 69 problems, accepted elsewhere	Calculator use stipulated for 110 problems, accepted elsewhere	Calculator use stipulated for 245 problems, accepted elsewhere	Calculator use encouraged about 57% (4/7) of the time overall	Calculator use encouraged for most problems
estimation over exact answers?	92 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted).	416 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted).	314 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted).	290 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted).	455 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted).	161 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted). Heavy calculator use de-emphasizes estimation.	158 problems require estimation, not exact answers (rounding not counted). Heavy calculator use de-emphasizes estimation.
peer dependence over personal skill-building?	Stresses independent work, except: 9 activities for pairs or small groups; all but 2 are in TE only	Stresses independent work, except: 26 group "Activity" exercises including games that introduce chapters	49 suggested group activities, 13 of these in SE	80 group activities, usually for pairs; includes recurring "Alternative Assessments" for student pairs	26 group activities; most suggested in TE, not SE	175 suggested group activities, most for partners, dilute independent work.	114 activities for pairs or small groups; part of every lesson
How thoroughly do the texts reinforce these skills?							
adding and subtracting decimals	364 problems (no calculator dependence)	164 problems (no calculator dependence)	177 problems (calculator used if faster)	165 problems (calculator used if faster)	144 problems (calculator used for large numbers)	79 problems (not including games, which may or may not use calculators)	113 problems (calculator used for all but initial problems on these operations)
adding and subtracting fractions	379 problems (no calculator dependence)	407 problems (no calculator dependence)	493 problems (suggests converting fractions to decimals on calculator before solving)	322 problems (suggests use of "fraction calculator")	406 problems (calculator not used for adding and subtracting fractions)	246 problems (suggests use of "fraction calculator")	152 problems (calculator not used for adding and subtracting fractions)
multiplying and dividing decimals	607 problems (no calculator dependence)	505 problems (no calculator dependence)	527 problems (calculator used if faster)	256 problems (calculator used if faster)	422 problems (calculator used for large numbers)	209 problems (not including games, which may or may not use calculators)	280 problems (calculators encouraged for all but initial problems on these operations)
multiplying and dividing fractions	470 problems (no calculator dependence)	415 problems (no calculator dependence)	454 problems (suggests converting fractions to decimals on calculator before solving)	297 problems (suggests use of "fraction calculator")	343 problems (calculator not used for multiplying and dividing fractions)	446 problems (suggests use of "fraction calculator")	316 problems (calculator use accepted but not encouraged for these operations)
finding area and perimeter of geometric shapes	Thorough (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Thorough (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Fair (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Poor (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Fair (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Minimal (2 of our 11 pages of documentation cover this)	Inconsistent Strong on some topics, weak on others (see our documentation)
OVERALL RATING	**BEST**	**GOOD**	**FAIR**	**FAIR**	**POOR**	**VERY POOR**	**WORST**

Daily number fact practice during 1st semester; daily mental math exercises all year

* The Texas textbook review panel found that *Everyday Math* meets 64.10% of Texas 6th grade Math standards (see pp. 1-3 at http://www.tea.state.tx.us/textbooks/materials/proc2004teksnot.pdf).

For full, fast documentation, contact:

Educational Research Analysts • P.O. Box 7518 • Longview, Texas 75607 • phone 903/753-5993 • fax 903/753-8424 • e-mail – info@textbookreviews.org

Extent of calculator dependence in 6th grade Math texts approved for 2007 local Texas adoption

SE = Student Edition; TE = Teacher's Edition; Numbers in ***bold italics*** indicate TE.

	SAXON MATH ***Course 1*** (Harcourt Achieve, 2007)	***MATH*** ***Course 1*** (McDougal, 2007)	***HOLT MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Holt, 2007)	***TEXAS MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Prentice, 2008)	***TEXAS MATH*** ***Course 1*** (Glencoe, 2007)	**Nonconforming** ***EVERYDAY MATH*** (McGraw, 2004)	***CONNECTED MATH 2*** (Prentice, 2008)
Stated policy on calculator use	No stated policy; 9 SE pages suggest calculator use; text 4 times refers students to the Saxon website for graphing calculator activities	Calculation treated as " 'practice makes perfect' " **not** as " 'something best left to calculators' " (p. ***T52***); calculator use usually limited to one "Technology Activity" per chapter	"Choose a solution method and solve …. You could use paper and pencil. But finding a product of 3-digit numbers requires several steps. Using a calculator will probably be faster." p. 31	"Students … expected to use graphing technology … no longer limited to four-function calculators." p. ***T26*** "Will you use estimation, mental math, paper and pencil, or a calculator …? " Sample answer: "calculator because it is faster" p. 15, #31	"Use a calculator if an exact answer is needed and the calculations are not simple enough to perform mentally and have fairly large numbers." p. 642, #12-5 Pp. 8-9 give detailed instruction on use of graphing calculator. Also see pp. 10, 51.	"… calculators … free both students and teachers from having to spend so much time on dull, repetitive, and unproductive tasks." *Teacher's Reference Manual*, p. 35, lines 1-3	"… we assume that students have access to calculators at all times. However, we hope that students will develop good estimation and mental arithmetic skills." *Prime Time*, p. ***16***, col. 2, par. 3, "A Note on Calculators"
How often does the text suggest calculator use for …							
multiplying by a 2- or 3-digit number?	not mentioned in SE (A few TE extension problems with very large numbers suggest calculator use.)	for 2 problems pp. 24, 37	for 13 problems pp. 31, 32, 49, 150, 550, 715	for 11 problems pp. 41, 42	for 3 problems pp. 9, 11	Actual amount of calculator use in "Games" component is indeterminate, but the main student workbook *(Math Journal)* and other student worksheets *(Math Masters)* direct students not to use calculators about 3/7 of the time. Calculator use is always acceptable unless there is a "No Calculator" icon.	Does not "designate specific 'calculator problems' " because calculators should be available "at all times" (see above) and "students should learn when their use is appropriate" (*Prime Time* p. ***13***, col. 1, par. 1); Exception: *Bits & Pieces* ***I, II,*** and ***III*** all encourage students to work without calculators when first learning fraction and decimal operations.
adding 3-digit or larger numbers?	for 1 problem Performance Activity 4 p. ***135B***	for 7 problems pp. 155, ***155***	for 3 problems p. 150	not mentioned	for 4 problems pp. 104, 105, 693		
finding decimal value of fractions?	for 4 problems pp. 386, 387	for 18 problems p. 276	for 5 problems p. 389, ***389***	for 9 problems pp. 280, 342, 343	for 30 problems pp. 208-210, ***210***		
finding circumference?	not expected	for 12 problems pp. 530, ***530***	not mentioned	for 11 problems pp. 440, 441, ***441***	for 22 problems pp. 490-493, ***490***, 504, 505, 522, 536, 686		
finding numerical equivalents of exponential expressions?	not expected	for 31 problems pp. 17, 20, 24	not mentioned	not mentioned	for 26 problems pp. 9, 33-34		
finding the mean?	not expected	not expected	not mentioned	not mentioned	for 11 problems pp. ***104***, 105, ***112***, 113		
checking paper-and-pencil answers?	for 13 problems pp. ***226***, ***346***, 386, ***438***, ***608***	not expected	for 12 problems p. 21	not mentioned	for 58 problems pp. 208, 535-537		
other mathematical operations?	for 16 problems pp. ***108***, 231, 232, 244, 245, ***274***, 437, 462, ***469***, 608	for 87 problems pp. 24, 37, 155, ***155***, 385, 441, ***441***, 602, 667, 688	for 36 problems pp. 31, 32, ***32***, 36, 39, 44, 57, 177, 187, 389, ***389***	for 79 problems pp. 15, 35, 78, 180, 237, 281, 345, 437, 547, ***570D***, 586, 588, 589, 590, 592-595, 599, 600	for 91 problems pp. 9, 26, 27, 48, 53, 104, 112, 113, 164, 209-210, 288, 314, 479, 487, 512, 522, 549, ***607***, ***611***, 693		
Total suggested calculator use	Suggested for 34 problems, not expected elsewhere	Stipulated for 157 problems, not expected elsewhere	Stipulated for 69 problems, accepted elsewhere	Stipulated for 110 problems, accepted elsewhere	Stipulated for 245 problems, accepted elsewhere	About 57% (4/7) of the time overall	Encouraged for most problems